

**THE FAILURE OF THE ROADMAP PEACE AGREEMENT
(2003-2005) IN RESOLVING THE PALESTINE-ISRAEL
CONFLICT**

UNDERGRADUATE THESIS



Written By:

NAVHAT NURANIYAH

20060510028

**INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS DEPARTMENT
FACULTY OF SOCIAL AND POLITICAL SCIENCES
UNIVERSITY OF MUHAMMADIYAH YOGYAKARTA**

2010

UNDERGRADUATE THESIS

**THE FAILURE OF THE ROADMAP PEACE AGREEMENT
(2003-2005) IN RESOLVING THE PALESTINE-ISRAEL
CONFLICT**

**Presented as part of the requirements for the Bachelor Degree of Political
Science in Department of International Relations, Faculty of Social and
Political Sciences, University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta**

Written by:

**NAVHAT NURANIYAH
20060510028**

Adviser: Surwandono, S.Sos, M.Si

**INTERNATIONAL CLASS
INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS DEPARTMENT
FACULTY OF SOCIAL AND POLITICAL SCIENCE
UNIVERSITY OF MUHAMMADIYAH YOGYAKARTA
2010**

ENDORSEMENT PAGE

**This Undergraduate Thesis Entitled:
The Failure of The Roadmap Peace Agreement (2003-2005) In Resolving The
Palestine-Israel Conflict**

**Written by:
Navhat Nuraniyah
20060510028**

This undergraduate thesis has been examined and endorsed by the Board of Examiners from the Department of International Relations, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

On
Day/Date: Monday/ August 16, 2010
Time: 9.30
Place: Room HI. B

**Acknowledged by,
Adviser/Chief of Examiner**

Surwandono, S.Sos, M.Si

Examiner I

Examiner II

**Dr. Sidik Jatmika
M.Si**

Takdir Ali Mukti, S.Sos,

I would like to dedicate this undergraduate thesis to:

My Lovely Mother, Dra. Hj. Umdatul Choirot

My Beloved Father, Drs. H. Achmad Hasan, M.Pd

My Dearest Husband, H. Ahmad Athoillah, M.Pd

“Yarfa’illahulladzina amanu minkum walladzina utul ‘ilma darojat”

(Holy Qur’an)

“Khourunnasi Anfa’uhum Linnas”

(Prophet Muhammad PBUH)

“All our dreams can come true if we have the courage to pursue them”

(Walt Disney)

FOREWORD

Alhamdulillah wa syukru lillah wassholatu wassalamu 'ala rosulillah. Praise be to Allah SWT, the most merciful. For His mercy, this undergraduate thesis entitled: **THE FAILURE OF ROADMAP PEACE AGREEMENT (2003-2005) IN RESOLVING THE PALESTINE-ISRAEL CONFLICT** is finally completed. This thesis is a form of intellectual expression after three years of learning in University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta and half a year in Monash University Australia. This thesis might still have some weaknesses, yet weakness is a process towards perfection. I hope that this thesis will be beneficial for the writer and other people especially the students and academics of University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta.

Yogyakarta, August 18, 2010

Navhat Nuraniyah
20060510028
nava.nurani@gmail.com

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

From the bottom of my heart, I would like to extend my deepest gratitude to:

1. Rector of University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Ir. Dasron Hamid, M.Sc
2. Dean of Faculty of Social and Political Sciences UMY, Prof. Tulus warsito
3. Head of International Relations Department, UMY, Sugeng Riyanto, S.Ip, M.Si
4. Head of International Class, Wahyuni Kartikasari, ST, M.Si
5. My supervisor, Mr. Surwandono, M.Si, for the inputs and brainstorming, for the prayer, and for his willingness to be consulted via email due to my conditions.
6. My examiners, Dr. Sidik Jatmika and Takdir Ali Mukti, S.Sos, M.Si for constructive critics and and for making things easier than I thought before.
7. All lecturers and tutors in International Relations Department, thank you for your guidance during my college years. All the knowledge and advice that you gave us mean the world to me.
8. My lecturers in Monash University Australia, especially Prof. Andrew Markus who opened my mind to learn more about Middle East and Dr. Paul Crossley for his passionate seminars where I learnt not only the knowledge but also critical thinking and friendship ☺
9. My Family: Ayah Ibu, Mbah Putri, Bapak, Ibu, My lovely hubby Mas Aik who's always there for me, My sisters and brothers; Mas Im, Bella, Dik Atik, Dik Azah, Dik Afid, Dik Ulin, my little nephew Aqeelah, and all uncles, aunts, and cousins, thanks for your prayer and support.
10. My little one who keeps kicking from inside my belly. You've been my biggest motivation to accomplish this thesis as fast as I could ☺
11. Officers of International Class, Bu Atik, and those of International Relations Department (Pak Jumari, Pak Ayub, Pak Waluyo), thanks for your patience and kindness in helping me.
12. My best best friends, the family of IC 2006: Anggit, Ulul, Dewi, Iis, Farah, Ita, Desy, Anita, Hangga, Why, Jenggis, Woko, Kimau, Gamar, Inu, Yudha, Iwan, Rizky, Daus, Dian, Yola, Ayu, Mutia, etc. Hopefully our friendship will last forever.
13. UMY Debaters: Mas Rangga, Mas Pido, Mas Ulum, Mas Ardhy, Mas Abi, Mbak Tia, Mbak Dety, Mbak Shellin, Mbak Nabila, Anam, Idham, Irsal, Maya, Kamal, Jojo, Kuncoro and the later generations. My coaches: Mas Irfan and Mas Arif. Keep debating for God's sake!!

14. My Great Teachers in PP Krapyak: Bu Nyai Nafisah Ali, Bu Nyai Lutfiyah Baidlowi, Bu Nyai Rifaidah Ali, Bu Hindun Anisah, Ust. Hilmy Muhammad, Ust. Zaky Muhammad, and all teachers of PP Ali Maksum. Thousand and thousands of gratitude will not compare what you have given me. Hopefully I can be a good and useful person like you all.
15. My friends in Asrama Gedung Putih, especially Mbak Novi, Mbak Chilma, Mbak Fitri, Mbak Yayah, Mbak Naning, Mbak Dina, Mbak Zidta, Mbak Anik, Nela, Utfah, Arifah, Ida, Dea, Zidni, Fafa, Rahma, Leli, etc. Thanks for our wonderful friendship!!
16. My friends who have coloured my days in Melbourne: Ana, Melody Stanford, Mbak Dian, little Yara and parents, Rath Vatey, Nidi, Maureen, Mbak Evi, Tom, Bang Tumpal, Mas Pataruka and fams. I miss u all, guyz!!
17. Participants of ASEAN-Korea Frontier Forum 2010: SiKyung, SoJeong, Siska, Vicky, our Opa, Roy, Rathana, the Vietnamese girl, etc. I'll never forget our nice memories in Seoul. Let's build our ASEAN!

ABSTRACT

This thesis sought to find out the causes that led to the failure of the Roadmap Peace Agreement (2003-2005) in settling the conflict between Israel and Palestine. Management school of Compliance Bargaining theory is used as the theoretical framework of the research. The research started from the hypothesis which argues that the failure is due to the noncomplying behaviour of the parties to the agreement in which such noncompliance is not a deliberate decision of the parties but rather impacts of some external factors. The method used in this thesis is qualitative method in form of literature studies from books, journals, and media. After thorough research, the writer found that the failure of Roadmap agreement to bring peace for Palestine and Israel is rooted in the ambiguity of the roadmap text as well as the lack of capabilities of Palestine and Israel to fulfill their obligations under the roadmap.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

COVER PAGE	i
ENDORSEMENT PAGE	ii
DEDICATION	iii
MOTTO	iv
FOREWORD	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	vi
ABSTRACT	viii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	ix

CHAPTER I. INTRODUCTION

A. Background of Issue	1
B. Research Question	10
C. Objective of Research.....	10
D. Theoretical Framework	10
D.1. Management School ..	15
A. Hypothesis	20
B. Research Method	20
C. Range of Research	22
D. Thesis Outline	22

CHAPTER II. PEACE EFFORTS IN THE HISTORY OF PALESTINE-ISRAEL CONFLICT

A.The Dynamic of Conflict and Peace Efforts In the Interwar Period.....	25
---	----

B.The Dynamic of Conflict and Peace Efforts In Post-1948 Era...	40
---	----

CHAPTER III. NEGOTIATING THE ROADMAP: THE BARGAINING AND DEALS

A.The Second Intifada: Conflict Escalation	55
B.The Ripe Moment for Negotiation	59
C.How The Roadmap Was Forged: The Bargaining	62
C. 1. Range of Roadmap Negotiation	64
D.The Roadmap Mandates: The Deals	73
D.1. Summary of Roadmap	76

CHAPTER IV. THE FACTORS CAUSING TH FAILURE OF ROADMAP (2003-2005) IN RESOLVING PALESTINE-ISRAEL CONFLICT

A.Ambiguity in Roadmap Text	88
B.The Incapability of the Parties to Carry Out Their Roadmap Obligations	101

CHAPTER V. CONCLUSION 115

REFERENCE LIST 117

APPENDIXES.....124

LIST OF APPENDIXES

Appendix 1. The Roadmap Text.....	124
Appendix 2. Israel's Roadmap Reservations.....	131
Appendix 3. Map of Eretz Israel.....	134
Appendix 4. The 1949 Armistice Lines.....	135
Appendix 5. Map of Israel (post-1967 war).....	136
Appendix 6. Map of West Bank	137
Appendix 7. Map of Security Fence.....	138
Appendix 8. Map of Jerusalem's Old City.....	139
Appendix 9. Map of Gaza	140

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Number of Palestinians and Israelis Killed Each Year Since 2000....	61
Figure 2. Political Assassinations By Israel	84
Figure 3. Incident of Palestine Suicide Bombing	85
Figure 4. Palestine Rockets and Mortar Fire	86
Figure 5. Regime Dynamics in Post-Agreement Negotiation.....	102

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Ambiguous Benchmark	89
Table 2. Grammatical Indeterminacy.....	93
Table 3. Imprecise Diction (1)	96
Table 4. Imprecise Diction (2)	98
Table 5. Assessment of Domestic Implementation.....	114