### **COVER PAGE**

# THE ADJUDICATION PROCESS OF INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE ON PEDRA BRANCA/*PULAU BATU PUTEH* DISPUTE BETWEEN MALAYSIA AND SINGAPORE

Presented as the Requirement for the Attainment the degree of Sarjana Ilmu Politik (S. IP) in the International Relations Department, Social and Political Sciences Faculty, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

# **Undergraduate Thesis**

Written by: Gesta Fauzia Nurbiansyah (20090510078)

Advisor: Dr. Surwandono, M.Si

International Program of International Relation Department Social and Political Sciences Faculty Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta 2013

i

#### **ENDORSEMENT PAGE**

This undergraduate thesis entitled:

# THE ADJUDICATION PROCESS OF INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE ON PEDRA BRANCA/*PULAU BATU PUTEH* DISPUTE BETWEEN MALAYSIA AND SINGAPORE

Written by:

Name : Gesta Fauzia Nurbiansyah

### NIM: 20090510078

This undergraduate thesis has been examined and endorsed by the board of examiners from the Department of International Relations, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta on

| Day/Date | : Tuesday / April 9, 2013                       |
|----------|---|
| Time     | : 08.00 a.m                                     |
| Place    | : Examination Room of International Relations C |

Acknowledge by:

Advisor/Chief of Examiner

### Dr. Surwandono, M.Si.

Examiner I

Examiner II

Sugito, S.IP, M.Si.

Dian Azmawati, S.IP., M.A

### STATE OF ORIGINALITY

This is certify that to the best of my knowledge, the content of this thesis my own work. This thesis has not been submitted for any degree or other purpose.

I certify that the intellectual content of this thesis is the product of my own work and that all the assistance received in preparing this thesis and sources have been acknowledged.

Yogyakarta, April 18, 2013

Gesta Fauzia Nurbiansyah

# ΜΟΤΤΟ

-In the name of Allah the most Grateful and the most Merciful-



"Start from your self Start from the smallest things Start from Now!!"

-Aa Gym-

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

THIS UNDERGRADUATE THESIS I DEDICATED TO MY FAMILY; MOTHER (YAYAT SURYATI), FATHER (SUBIYANTO) THANKS FOR YOUR AFFCETION, YOU ARE MY INSPIRATION AND THE BEST SUPPORTERS FOREVER, I LOVE YOU MAM AND DAD..

MY YOUNGER SISTER (SYIFA DWI KURNIA), MY YOUNGER BROTHER (FIRMAN DWI ROYANSYAH)..

### FOREWORD

Alhamdulilah hirabbil'alamin, highest praise and thanks to Illahirobbi, because of Him I can pass all these and finish the final duty which entitles "The Adjudication Process of International Court of Justice on Pedra Branca/*Pulau Batu Puteh* between Malaysia and Singapore" well. Shalawat and Salam, I praise for my Prophet Muhammad SAW and his family.

Also, I would give my thanks to:

- My deepest appreciation goes to Prof. Dr. Bambang Cipto, M.A (The Rector of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta), Dr. Achmad Nurmandi, M.Sc. (The dean of Social and political science faculty), Dr. Ali Muhammad, MA. (The head of International relations department), Mrs. Ratih Herningtyas, S.IP, M.A (The Director of IPIREL).
- My greatest advisor Dr. Surwandono, M.Si who have supported and assisted me in finishing this undergradute thesis, many advices academically and spiritually, so I can become the strong person in finishing my study and facing undergraduate thesis examianation well "*Thanks for everything Bapak*". Mr. Sugito, S.IP., M.Si (Examiner I) that suggested me to change my "research question" on my undergraduate thesis to make easier, Mrs. Dian Azmawati, S.IP.,M.A. (Examiner II) "thanks for your questions mam".
- All lectures of International Relations Department.
- My language consultant, Mr. Reko Serasi, S.S., M.A in Languange Training Center (PPB). He makes me realize how poor my writing is.
- Mrs. Atik (Official Staff in International Program for International Relations (IPIREL), Mr. Djumari, Mr. Ayub and Mr. Waluyo (the student service in International Relations Department office).
- The grateful thanks to my family, my beloved parents (Mr. Subiyanto and Mrs. Yayat Suryati) who have been whole heartily love me and totally struggle for my living and future, so that I can reach to this level. There is no enough word to describe my thankful to you and I pray to Allah to love you both and make

you happy till the end, Aamiin.For my sweeter sister and brother (Syifa Dwi Kurnia and Firman Dwi Royansyah) and the special one girl (Rahmi Fitri Azizah) because of you my live have been colored by your support, laught, tears, jokes and indulges. Thanks for your helps during my undergraduate thesis work. I love you forever and I hope we eill never be apart.

- Huge thanks to my friends and community; the first is the family of IPIREL, especially my classmate IC'09: Mas Anis, Mbak Ar, Mbak Az, Kiki (koko), Icha, mbak LBK (Lusi Budhi Karomah), Naffy, mbak Fer, Mbak Iran, Ose (Masyitoh), Bro Ayu and tante Beu, my brother Ipin, mpok Ella, Intan and Kirana (the Twin Girls), Aryati, Somchai (My sharing in the same stuggle friend in every time and places..hehe), mas Alvin and Ferdian Anu, Rizal (Kuya), Sob Lalu, Danan, Nailus, Bang Bella Nova, Putra (*cacad*), Tri Mahardi (*Pak Lurah*) and others "*Pejuang Veteran*" of IC: Om boeng, Agil, Canggih, Jajang, Cinta, Triyadi. Javiez, Izzah, and Adi Donk who already moved from IPIREL and this university, also Boteng as my inspirator. Thank you for all of you. The second, my family in PAMOR RAYA (Perhimpunan Mahasiswa Bogor DI-Yogyakarta), Alumni Al-Kahfi Yogya-Solo and FORSILAM Yogyakarta that always support and entertaint me before my undergraduate thesis examination. IPIREL 2010, 2011, 2012 and all HI students batch '09.
- Also thank you very much to my Malaysian friend "Meor" who gave the inspiration about the topic of my undergraduate thesis (*bile nak main ke indo lagi?hehe*) and Regie M Herlan (Kaka) thank you for your support and aid (your printer, your papers and all) your are my kindest brother.
- And All friends that I know who cannot be mentioned.

### ABSTRACTION

After several decades the nation-state was unable in settle of several issues and problems between states through diplomatic negotiation. The International Organization began to appear, changed the nation-state as a primarily actor in political affairs. The International Court of Justice (ICJ) a principal organ of the United Nations (UN) as the biggest International Organization has believed as the best adjudication way in disputes settlement between states, such as territorial dispute. Hence, in 2003 Malaysia and Singapore agreed to submit their territorial dispute over sovereignty of Pedra Branca/*Pulau Batu Puteh* in the entrance on Straits of Singapore and two others maritime features Middle Rock and South Ledge to the ICJ. Furthermore, the dispute was resolved after the final decision of Court on May, 2008. In line with the title, this undergraduate theis tried to explain about The Adjudicarion Process of International Court of Justice on Pedra Branca/*Pulau Batu Puteh* dispute between Malaysia and Singapore.

### **TABLE OF CONTENT**

| COVER PAGEi                 |  |
|-----------------------------|--|
| ENDORSEMENT PAGEii          |  |
| STATE OF ORIGINALITYiii     |  |
| MOTTOii                     |  |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTSv           |  |
| FOREWORD vi                 |  |
| ABSTRACTION viii            |  |
| FABLE OF CONTENTiix         |  |
| LIST OF PICTURE AND TABLExi |  |

| CHA | PTER I INTRODUCTION  | 1    |
|-----|--|------|
| A.  | Problem Background   | 1    |
| B.  | Purposes of Writing  | 5    |
| C.  | Research Questions   | 6    |
| D.  | Theoretical Framework  | 6    |
| 1   | . International Adjudication   | 6    |
| 2   | . The Rules and Procedure within the ICJ   | . 10 |
| E.  | Hypothesis   | . 15 |
| F.  | Methods of Writing   | . 15 |
| G.  | The Research Area  | . 16 |
| Н.  | Systematic of Writing  | . 16 |
|     | PTER II THE DYNAMIC OF INTERNATIONAL COURT<br>ICE IN TERRITORIAL DISPUTES SETTLEMENT |      |
| A.  | General Profile of International Court of Justice (ICJ)                              | . 18 |
| B.  | The History of International Court of Justice (ICJ)                                  | . 22 |
| C.  | The Jurisdiction of International Court of Justice (ICJ) in Settling the Disputes    | 28   |
| 1   | . Contentious Jurisdiction   | 28   |

| a)     | Special agreements (Compromis)  | . 28 |
|--------|---|------|
| b)     | Jurisdiction Provided for in Treaties and Conventions   | . 29 |
| c)     | Declarations Accepting the Compulsory Jurisdiction of the Court<br>("Optional Clause" System)             | . 30 |
| 2.     | Advisory Jurisdiction (Advisory Opinion)  | . 33 |
|        | ER III PEDRA BRANCA/ <i>PULAU BATU PUTEH</i> DISPU<br>EN MALAYSIA AND SINGAPORE                           |      |
| A. Ge  | eographical Situation of Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh  | . 38 |
|        | e Historical Background of Pedra Branca/ <i>Pulau Batu Puteh</i> dispute<br>etween Malaysia and Singapore | . 41 |
|        | e Arguments and Positions of Malaysia and Singapore in Claiming edra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh              | . 48 |
|        | ER IV THE MECHANISM OF ICJ DECISION IN PED<br>A <i> PULAU BATU PUTEH</i> DISPUTE                          |      |
| A. Th  | e Procedure of ICJ in Pedra Branca Case   | . 56 |
| 1.     | Special Agreement   | . 56 |
| 2.     | Written Pleadings   | . 59 |
| a)     | Memorials of Parties  | . 59 |
| b)     | Counter-Memorials   | . 62 |
| c)     | Replies of Parties  | . 68 |
| 3.     | Oral Pleadings  | . 78 |
| a)     | Representatives of Singapore:   | . 78 |
| b)     | Representatives of Malaysia:  | . 79 |
| 4.     | The Court's Judgements  | . 80 |
| B. Th  | e Considerations of the Court toward Pedra Branca Dispute   | . 82 |
| C. Th  | e Responses of Parties toward ICJ Decision  | . 88 |
| 1.     | Malaysia want to Retaking Pedra Branca from Singapore   | . 88 |
| 2.     | Singapore's Response about the Territorial Delimitation   | . 91 |
| CHAPT  | ER V CONCLUSION   | . 94 |
| REFERE | NCES  | .97  |
| ATTACH | IMENT   |      |

## LIST OF PICTURE AND TABLE

### LIST OF PICTURE

| Picture 1: The Map of Singapore Strait | .39 |
|--|-----|
|--|-----|

## LIST OF TABLE