

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN LAW-MAKING PROCESS:
A COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN
INDONESIA AND SOUTH AFRICA**

Undergraduate Thesis



Written By:

Ichwan Rizki Akbar Napitupulu

NIM. 20200610230

Faculty of Law

International Program for Law and Sharia

Constitutional Law

Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

2024

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN LAW-MAKING PROCESS:
A COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN
INDONESIA AND SOUTH AFRICA**

Undergraduate Thesis



Written By:

Ichwan Rizki Akbar Napitupulu

NIM. 20200610230

**Faculty of Law
International Program for Law and Sharia
Constitutional Law
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta
2024**

APPROVAL PAGE

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN LAW-MAKING PROCESS: A
COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN INDONESIA AND SOUTH AFRICA**

Undergraduate Thesis

This Undergraduate thesis is submitted as one of the requirements to obtain the degree of Bachelor of Laws at the Faculty of Law Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Written by:

Ichwan Rizki Akbar Napitupulu

NIM. 20200610230



UNIVERSITAS
MUHAMMADIYAH

This Undergraduate thesis has been approved by the Supervisor on Friday,
August 16th, 2024

Supervisor

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'NANIK', is written over a faint, circular stamp. The signature is fluid and cursive.

Dr. Nanik Prasetyoningsih, S.H., M.H.
NIK. 19740415200004153043

DECLARATION PAGE

I am the undersigned:

Name : Ichwan Rizki Akbar Napitupulu

Student Number : 20200610230

Title of thesis : **PUBLIC PARTICIPTION IN LAW-MAKING
PROCESS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN
INDONESIA AND SOUTH AFRICA**

I hereby declare that the content of this Undergraduate Thesis, is truly the work of my own and I did not do a plagiarism or quotation in ways that are inconsistent with the prevailing ethics in the scientific community. By having this statement, I am ready to bear the risk/any sanctions imposed to me in accordance with the applicable regulations. If in the future a breach of scientific ethics is found, I am willing to accept the sanctions.

On this statement, I made it in conscious and without coercion from any.

UMY

UNIVERSITAS
MUHAMMADIYAH
YOGYAKARTA

Yogyakarta. September 4th, 2024



Ichwan Rizki Akbar Napitupulu
NIM. 20200610230

MOTTO PAGE

فَإِنَّ مَعَ الْعُسْرِ يُسْرًا

“Because indeed after hardship there is ease”

(Q.S. al-Insyirah: 5)



UMY

UNIVERSITAS
MUHAMMADIYAH
YOGYAKARTA

Unggul & Islami

DEDICATION PAGE

Alhamdulillahirabbil'alamin.

Praise be to Allah *subhanahu wa ta'ala*, Lord of the Universe, and peace be upon His most beloved prophet and messenger, Muhammad, and all his family and companions. Upon the accomplishment of my undergraduate thesis, I would like to dedicate this to:

1. The Best Parents that I could ever have, *Ayah* Rahmad Napitupulu and *Mami* Bibah Novita Sari.
2. My Brother Reza Aulia Rahmat Napitupulu and My dearest little Sister Aliya Ophira Zahra Napitupulu.



FOREWORDS

Assalamualaikum Wr. Wb.

Alhamdulillah Walhamdulillah tsumma Alhamdulillah, I am forever grateful for the presence of Allah SWT, the Most Merciful and The Most Gracious who has given me His blessings and an opportunity to accomplish my undergraduate thesis as my final work entitled “**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN LAW-MAKING PROCESS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN INDONESIA AND SOUTH AFRICA**” to fulfill the requirement to obtain the degree of Bachelor of Law at the International Program for Law and Sharia, Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta.

I do realize that in the process of writing this thesis, there were many parties who have helped and guided me, thus I would like to express my sincere gratitude to:

1. Prof. Dr. Ir. Gunawan Budiyanto, M.P., IPM., ASEAN.Eng., as Rector of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta.
2. Prof. Iwan Satriawan, S.H., MCL., Ph.D., as the Dean of Faculty of Law. Thank you for your thoughtful motivation and appreciation as the examiner of my thesis.
3. Sunarno, S.H., M.Hum., Ph.D., as the Head of Law Departement. Thank you for every single one of the Islamic wise advices.
4. Muh. Endriyo Susila, S.H., MCL., Ph.D., as the Director of the International Program for Law and Sharia (IPOLS), Faculty of Law.
5. Dr. Nanik Prasetyoningsih, S.H., M.H., who is supervising my thesis. You have been an incredible mentor to me, and I am very thankful for the opportunity you gave me. Your insight, kindness, and compassion have changed the course of my study and helped me develop as a researcher. The wisdom she has shared with me will guide me in my future undertakings, both academic and professional, and I will be eternally grateful to you for all the help you have given me.

6. My beloved parents, *Ayah* Rahmad Napitupulu and *Mami* Bibah Novita Sari, my cherished parents, have been my pillars of fortitude and unwavering sources of love, guidance, and support. They hold a cherished position in my heart. Your prayers, which are delivered with sincerity and devotion, have been a source of comfort and fortitude, providing me with the fortitude to confront the obstacles of life and the perseverance to endure adversity.
7. My friends from ARAB; Ahmad Fahmi Ilham Mulloh, S.H., Irvan Mareto, S.H., Kevin Syahru Azham, (UO S.H.), M. Fabian Akbar, S.H., M. Alwan Zain Nusantara (Candidate S.H.), Andi Pramudya Syamsu, Purwandito Daffa Saputra (Candidate S.H.), M. Hanaan Alfarizi, S.H., Fawaz Muhammad Ihsan, S.H., Ayi Dudi Firdaus, (UO S.H.), Calvin Al-Fitrah (*Investor tetap UMY*), Reksa Fikri Nurhaifa (*Investor tetap UMY*). Thank you for being a part of my college life and family in Yogyakarta. Each of you has brought unique talents, perspectives, and contributions to our collective experience, enriching our time together and leaving an indelible mark on our shared memories. It's been a long road for us, keep working hard, and see you on top.
8. All my fellow IPOLianS batch of 2020 friends, whom I am immensely proud of. Together, we have shared countless memories, overcome challenges, and celebrated achievements, forging bonds that will last a lifetime.
9. To Adinda Dwi Asmodiwaty, Your presence has been a source of inspiration and fortitude during the composition of this thesis. I am grateful for the invaluable assistance and comprehension you have provided. You were consistently present during the most challenging periods, providing me with the motivation that enabled me to persevere. This thesis is not only the outcome of diligent effort, but also the product of your encouragement and affection.
10. Last but not least, I want to thank me, I want to thank me for believing in me, I want to thank me for doing all this hard work. I want to thank me for having no days off. I want to thank me for never quitting. I want to thank me for always being a giver and trying more than I receive. I want to thank me for trying to do more right than wrong. I want to thank me for being me at all times

I realized that this writing is still far from perfection, therefore any suggestions and constructive criticism will be expected me as a self introspection. Finally, I do expect this thesis will give benefits for readers and future researchers.
Wassalamu'alaikum Wr. Wb.

Yogyakarta, September 4th, 2024



Ichwan Rizki Akbar Napitupulu
NIM. 20200610230

TABLE OF CONTENT

TITLE PAGE	i
APPROVAL PAGE	ii
ENDORSEMENT PAGE	iii
DECLARATION PAGE	iv
MOTTO PAGE	v
DEDICATION PAGE	vi
FOREWORDS	vii
TABLE OF CONTENT	x
LIST OF TABLE	xi
LIST OF STATUTES	xii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
ABSTRACT	xiv
CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION	1
A. Background of Research	1
B. Problems Formulation	6
C. Objectives of Research.....	6
D. Benefits of Research.....	7
CHAPTER II LITERATURE REVIEW	8
A. The Indonesian Legislation and Regulation System	8
B. The Definition of Public Participation	10
C. Theory and Concept of Legitimacy	14
CHAPTER III RESEARCH METHOD	19
A. Type of Research.....	19
B. Type of Data	19
C. Method of Collecting Data	21
D. Method of Data Analysis.....	22
CHAPTER IV FINDING AND ANALYSIS	23
A. Critical Assessment on Public Participation in the Law-Making Process	23
B. Implication for Legitimacy in the Law-Making Process without Involving Public Participation	31
C. An analysis of Public Participation in the Legislative Process in Indonesia and South Africa.....	38
CHAPTER V CLOSING	52
A. Conclusion.....	52
B. Recommendation.....	53
BIBLIOGRAPHY	54
ATTACHMENT	62

LIST OF TABLE

Table 4.1. Comparison of Public Participation in the Law-Making Process Between Indonesia and South Africa.....	49
---	----

LIST OF STATUTES

1. The Indonesian 1945 Constitution.
2. The South African 1996 Constitution.
3. Law Number 6 of 2023 on Job Creation.
4. Law Number 13 of 2022 on the Second Amendment to Law Number 12 of 2011 on the Formation of Legislation.
5. Law Number 17 of 2013 on Community Organizations (CSOs).
6. Law Number 12 of 2011 on the Establishment of Laws and Regulations.
7. Law Number 11 of 2008 on Information and Electronic Transactions (IET).
8. Law Number 32 of 2002 on Broadcasting.
9. Law Number 40 of 1999 on the Press.
10. Constitutional Court Regulation (CCR) Number 06/PMK/2005 on Guidelines for Proceedings in Cases of Testing Laws against the State Constitution.
11. Constitutional Court Decision Number 40/PUU-XXI/2023 on the Formil Test case of Law Number 6 of 2023 on the Stipulation of Government Regulations in Lieu of Law Number 2 of 2022 on Job Creation Law against the Indonesian 1945 Constitutional.
12. Constitutional Court Decision Number 91/PUU-XVII/2020 on the Formil Testing case of Law Number 11 of 2020 on Job Creation against the Indonesia 1945 Constitutional.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CSO	: Civil Society Organization
DPD	: <i>Dewan Perwakilan Daerah</i> /The Regional Representative Council
DPR	: Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat/The House of Representatives
DPRD	: <i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah</i> /The Regional House of Representatives
IET	: Information and Electronic Transactions
KSPSI	: <i>Konfederasi Serikat Pekerja Seluruh Indonesia</i> / The Confederation of Trade Unions of All Indonesia
MK	: <i>Mahkamah Konstitusi</i> /Constitutional Court
NGO	: Non-Government Organization
PAIA	: The Promotion of Access to Information Act
PAJA	: The Promotion of Administrative Justice Act
PMK	: <i>Peraturan Mahkamah Konstitusi</i> /Constitutional Court Regulations
RDPU	: <i>Rapat Dengar Pendapat Umum</i> /Public Hearing Meetings
RUU	: <i>Rancangan Undang-undang</i> /Bill